As Introduced

133rd General Assembly Regular Session 2019-2020

H. B. No. 136

Representative Hillyer

Cosponsors: Representatives Seitz, Weinstein, Crawley

A BILL

То	amend sections 2929.02, 2929.022, 2929.024,	1
	2929.03, 2929.04, 2929.06, 2953.21, and 2953.23	2
	and to enact section 2929.025 of the Revised	3
	Code to prohibit imposing the death penalty for	4
	aggravated murder when the offender had a	5
	serious mental illness at the time of the	6
	offense.	7

BE IT ENACTED BY THE GENERAL ASSEMBLY OF THE STATE OF OHIO:

Section 1. That sections 2929.02, 2929.022, 2929.024,	8
2929.03, 2929.04, 2929.06, 2953.21, and 2953.23 be amended and	9
section 2929.025 of the Revised Code be enacted to read as	10
follows:	11
Sec. 2929.02. (A) Whoever is convicted of or pleads guilty	12
det. 2727.021 (iii, imperior 15 convicted of of product garrey	
to aggravated murder in violation of section 2903.01 of the	13
Revised Code shall suffer death or be imprisoned for life, as	14
determined pursuant to sections 2929.022, 2929.03, and 2929.04	15
of the Revised Code, except that no person who raises the matter	16
of age pursuant to section 2929.023 of the Revised Code and who	17
is not found to have been eighteen years of age or older at the	1.8

H. B. No. 136
Page 2
As Introduced

time of the commission of the offense and no person who raises	19
the matter of the person's serious mental illness at the time of	20
the alleged commission of the offense pursuant to section	21
2929.025 of the Revised Code and is found under that section to	22
be ineligible for a sentence of death due to serious mental	23
<u>illness</u> shall suffer death. In addition, the offender may be	24
fined an amount fixed by the court, but not more than twenty-	25
five thousand dollars.	26
(B)(1) Except as otherwise provided in division (B)(2) or	27
(3) of this section, whoever is convicted of or pleads guilty to	28
murder in violation of section 2903.02 of the Revised Code shall	29
be imprisoned for an indefinite term of fifteen years to life.	30
(2) Except as otherwise provided in division (B)(3) of	31
this section, if a person is convicted of or pleads guilty to	32
murder in violation of section 2903.02 of the Revised Code, the	33
victim of the offense was less than thirteen years of age, and	34
the offender also is convicted of or pleads guilty to a sexual	35
motivation specification that was included in the indictment,	36
count in the indictment, or information charging the offense,	37
the court shall impose an indefinite prison term of thirty years	38
to life pursuant to division (B)(3) of section 2971.03 of the	39
Revised Code.	40
(3) If a person is convicted of or pleads guilty to murder	41
in violation of section 2903.02 of the Revised Code and also is	42
convicted of or pleads guilty to a sexual motivation	43
specification and a sexually violent predator specification that	44
were included in the indictment, count in the indictment, or	45

information that charged the murder, the court shall impose upon

shall be served pursuant to section 2971.03 of the Revised Code.

the offender a term of life imprisonment without parole that

46

47

(4) In addition, the offender may be fined an amount fixed	49
by the court, but not more than fifteen thousand dollars.	50
(C) The court shall not impose a fine or fines for	51
aggravated murder or murder which, in the aggregate and to the	52
extent not suspended by the court, exceeds the amount which the	53
offender is or will be able to pay by the method and within the	54
time allowed without undue hardship to the offender or to the	55
dependents of the offender, or will prevent the offender from	56
making reparation for the victim's wrongful death.	57
(D)(1) In addition to any other sanctions imposed for a	58
violation of section 2903.01 or 2903.02 of the Revised Code, if	59
the offender used a motor vehicle as the means to commit the	60
violation, the court shall impose upon the offender a class two	61
suspension of the offender's driver's license, commercial	62
driver's license, temporary instruction permit, probationary	63
license, or nonresident operating privilege as specified in	64
division (A)(2) of section 4510.02 of the Revised Code.	65
(2) As used in division (D) of this section, "motor	66
vehicle" has the same meaning as in section 4501.01 of the	67
Revised Code.	68
Sec. 2929.022. (A) If an indictment or count in an	69
indictment charging a defendant with aggravated murder contains	70
a specification of the aggravating circumstance of a prior	71
conviction listed in division (A)(5) of section 2929.04 of the	72
Revised Code, the defendant may elect to have the panel of three	73
judges, if the defendant waives trial by jury, or the trial	74
judge, if the defendant is tried by jury, determine the	75
existence of that aggravating circumstance at the sentencing	76
hearing held pursuant to divisions (C) and (D) of section	77

hearing held pursuant to divisions (C) and (D) of section

78

2929.03 of the Revised Code.

(1) If the defendant does not elect to have the existence	79
of the aggravating circumstance determined at the sentencing	80
hearing, the defendant shall be tried on the charge of	81
aggravated murder, on the specification of the aggravating	82
circumstance of a prior conviction listed in division (A)(5) of	83
section 2929.04 of the Revised Code, and on any other	84
specifications of an aggravating circumstance listed in division	85
(A) of section 2929.04 of the Revised Code in a single trial as	86
in any other criminal case in which a person is charged with	87
aggravated murder and specifications.	88
(2) If the defendant does elect to have the existence of	89
the aggravating circumstance of a prior conviction listed in	90
division (A)(5) of section 2929.04 of the Revised Code	91
determined at the sentencing hearing, then, following a verdict	92
of guilty of the charge of aggravated murder, the panel of three	93
judges or the trial judge shall:	94
(a) Hold a sentencing hearing pursuant to division (B) of	95
this section, unless required to do otherwise under division (A)	96
(2) (b) of this section;	97
(b) If the offender raises the matter of age at trial	98
pursuant to section 2929.023 of the Revised Code and is not	99
found at trial to have been eighteen years of age or older at	100
the time of the commission of the offense or raises the matter	101
of the offender's serious mental illness at the time of the	102
alleged commission of the offense pursuant to section 2929.025	103
of the Revised Code and is found under that section to be	104
ineligible for a sentence of death due to serious mental	105
<u>illness</u> , conduct a hearing to determine if the specification of	106
the aggravating circumstance of a prior conviction listed in	107
division (A)(5) of section 2929.04 of the Revised Code is proven	108

beyond a reasonable doubt. After conducting the hearing, the panel or judge shall proceed as follows: 110

(i) If that aggravating circumstance is proven beyond a 111 reasonable doubt or if the defendant at trial was convicted of 112 any other specification of an aggravating circumstance, the 113 panel or judge shall impose sentence according to division (E) 114 of section 2929.03 of the Revised Code. 115

116

117

118

119

120

121

122

123

124

125

126

127

128

129

130

131

- (ii) If that aggravating circumstance is not proven beyond a reasonable doubt and the defendant at trial was not convicted of any other specification of an aggravating circumstance, except as otherwise provided in this division, the panel or judge shall impose sentence of life imprisonment with parole eligibility after serving twenty years of imprisonment on the offender. If that aggravating circumstance is not proven beyond a reasonable doubt, the defendant at trial was not convicted of any other specification of an aggravating circumstance, the victim of the aggravated murder was less than thirteen years of age, and the offender also is convicted of or pleads guilty to a sexual motivation specification that was included in the indictment, count in the indictment, or information charging the offense, the panel or judge shall sentence the offender pursuant to division (B)(3) of section 2971.03 of the Revised Code to an indefinite term consisting of a minimum term of thirty years and a maximum term of life imprisonment.
- (B) At the sentencing hearing, the panel of judges, if the defendant was tried by a panel of three judges, or the trial 134 judge, if the defendant was tried by jury, shall, when required 135 pursuant to division (A)(2) of this section, first determine if 136 the specification of the aggravating circumstance of a prior 137 conviction listed in division (A)(5) of section 2929.04 of the 138

Revised Code is proven beyond a reasonable doubt. If the panel	139
of judges or the trial judge determines that the specification	140
of the aggravating circumstance of a prior conviction listed in	141
division (A)(5) of section 2929.04 of the Revised Code is proven	142
beyond a reasonable doubt or if they do not determine that the	143
specification is proven beyond a reasonable doubt but the	144
defendant at trial was convicted of a specification of any other	145
aggravating circumstance listed in division (A) of section	146
2929.04 of the Revised Code, the panel of judges or the trial	147
judge and trial jury shall impose sentence on the offender	148
pursuant to division (D) of section 2929.03 and section 2929.04	149
of the Revised Code. If the panel of judges or the trial judge	150
does not determine that the specification of the aggravating	151
circumstance of a prior conviction listed in division (A)(5) of	152
section 2929.04 of the Revised Code is proven beyond a	153
reasonable doubt and the defendant at trial was not convicted of	154
any other specification of an aggravating circumstance listed in	155
division (A) of section 2929.04 of the Revised Code, the panel	156
of judges or the trial judge shall terminate the sentencing	157
hearing and impose sentence on the offender as follows:	158
(1) Subject to division (B)(2) of this section, the panel	159
or judge shall impose a sentence of life imprisonment with	160
parole eligibility after serving twenty years of imprisonment on	161
the offender.	162
(2) If the victim of the aggravated murder was less than	163

(2) If the victim of the aggravated murder was less than

thirteen years of age and the offender also is convicted of or

pleads guilty to a sexual motivation specification that was

included in the indictment, count in the indictment, or

information charging the offense, the panel or judge shall

sentence the offender pursuant to division (B)(3) of section

168

2971.03 of the Revised Code to an indefinite term consisting of

a minimum term of thirty years and a maximum term of life	170
<pre>imprisonment.</pre>	171
Sec. 2929.024. If (A) In a case described in division (B)	172
of this section, if the court determines that the defendant is	173
indigent and that investigation services, experts, or other	174
services are reasonably necessary for the proper representation	175
of a defendant charged with aggravated murder at trial or at the	176
sentencing hearing, the court shall authorize the defendant's	177
counsel to obtain the necessary services for the defendant, and	178
shall order that payment of the fees and expenses for the	179
necessary services be made in the same manner that payment for	180
appointed counsel is made pursuant to Chapter 120. of the	181
Revised Code. If the court determines that the necessary	182
services had to be obtained prior to court authorization for	183
payment of the fees and expenses for the necessary services, the	184
court may, after the services have been obtained, authorize the	185
defendant's counsel to obtain the necessary services and order	186
that payment of the fees and expenses for the necessary services	187
be made as provided in this section.	188
(B) Division (A) of this section applies in a case in	189
which either of the following apply:	190
(1) The court determines that the defendant is indigent.	191
(2) The defendant is described in division (C) of section	192
2929.025 of the Revised Code and raises the matter of the	193
defendant's serious mental illness at the time of the alleged	194
commission of the aggravated murder as described in that	195
division.	196
Sec. 2929.025. (A) As used in this section:	197
(1) A person has a "serious mental illness" if both of the	198

following apply with respect to the person, subject to division	199
(A) (2) of this section:	200
(a) The person has been diagnosed as described in division	201
(B) of this section with one or more of the following	202
conditions:	203
(i) Schizophrenia;	204
(ii) Schizoaffective disorder;	205
(iii) Bipolar disorder;	206
(iv) Major depressive disorder;	207
(v) Delusional disorder.	208
(b) At the time of the alleged aggravated murder with	209
which the person is charged, the condition or conditions	210
described in division (A)(1)(a) of this section with which the	211
person has been diagnosed, while not meeting the standard to be	212
found not guilty by reason of insanity as defined in section	213
2901.01 of the Revised Code or the standard to be found	214
incompetent to stand trial as described in division (G) of	215
section 2945.37 of the Revised Code, nevertheless significantly	216
impaired the person's capacity to exercise rational judgment in	217
relation to the person's conduct with respect to either of the	218
<pre>following:</pre>	219
(i) Conforming the person's conduct to the requirements of	220
law;	221
(ii) Appreciating the nature, consequences, or	222
wrongfulness of the person's conduct.	223
(2) A disorder manifested primarily by repeated criminal	224
conduct or attributable solely to the acute effects of voluntary	225

use of alcohol or any other drug of abuse does not, standing	226
alone, constitute a "serious mental illness" for purposes of	227
division (A)(1) of this section.	228
(3) "Examiner" means a person who makes an evaluation	229
ordered under division (F)(1) of this section.	230
(4) "Prosecutor" means a prosecuting attorney who has	231
authority to prosecute a charge of aggravated murder that is	232
before the court.	233
(B) The diagnosis of a person with a condition or	234
conditions described in division (A)(1)(a) of this section may	235
be made at any time prior to, on, or after the day of the	236
alleged aggravated murder with which the person is charged or	237
the day on which the person pursuant to division (C) of this	238
section raises the matter of the person's serious mental illness	239
at the time of the alleged commission of that aggravated murder.	240
Diagnosis of the condition or conditions after the date of the	241
alleged aggravated murder with which the person is charged does	242
not preclude the person from presenting evidence that the person	243
had a serious mental illness at the time of the alleged	244
commission of that offense.	245
(C) A person charged with aggravated murder and one or	246
more specifications of an aggravating circumstance listed in	247
division (A) of section 2929.04 of the Revised Code may, before	248
trial, raise the matter of the person's serious mental illness	249
at the time of the alleged commission of the offense. If a	250
person raises the matter of the person's serious mental illness	251
at the time of the alleged commission of the offense, the court	252
shall order an evaluation of the person in accordance with	253
division (F) of this section and shall hold a pretrial hearing	254
on the matter. The person who raises the matter may present	255

evidence that the person had a serious mental illness at the	256
time of the alleged commission of the offense, and the person	257
has the burden of raising that matter and of going forward with	258
the evidence relating to the diagnosis described in division (A)	259
(1) (a) of this section and the impairment described in division	260
(A)(1)(b) of this section.	261
(D) If a person described in division (C) of this section	262
raises the matter of the person's serious mental illness at the	263
time of the alleged commission of the aggravated murder and	264
submits evidence that the person has been diagnosed with one or	265
more of the conditions set forth in division (A)(1)(a) of this	266
section and that the condition or conditions diagnosed	267
significantly impaired the person's capacity at the time of the	268
alleged offense in a manner described in division (A)(1)(b) of	269
this section, the prosecution shall have an opportunity to	270
present evidence to contest the diagnosis. The defendant has the	271
burden of proving, by a preponderance of the evidence, that the	272
person has been diagnosed with one or more of the conditions set	273
forth in division (A)(1)(a) of this section and that the	274
condition or conditions diagnosed significantly impaired the	275
person's capacity at the time of the alleged offense in a manner	276
described in division (A)(1)(b) of this section.	277
(E)(1) Unless the court at the pretrial hearing finds that	278
the defendant has proved, by a preponderance of the evidence,	279
that the person has been diagnosed with one or more of the	280
conditions set forth in division (A)(1)(a) of this section and	281
that the condition or conditions diagnosed significantly	282
impaired the person's capacity at the time of the alleged	283
offense in a manner described in division (A)(1)(b) of this	284
section, the court shall issue a finding that the person is not	285
ineligible for a sentence of death due to serious mental	286

<u>illness.</u>	287
(2) If the court at the pretrial hearing finds that the	288
defendant has proved, by a preponderance of the evidence, that	289
the person has been diagnosed with one or more of the conditions	290
set forth in division (A)(1)(a) of this section and that the	291
condition or conditions diagnosed significantly impaired the	292
person's capacity at the time of the alleged offense in a manner	293
described in division (A)(1)(b) of this section, the court shall	294
issue a finding that the person is ineligible for a sentence of	295
death due to serious mental illness.	296
(F)(1) If a person described in division (C) of this	297
section raises the matter of the person's serious mental illness	298
at the time of the alleged commission of the aggravated murder	299
as described in that division, the court shall order an	300
evaluation of the person. Section 2929.024 of the Revised Code	301
applies with respect to an evaluation ordered under this	302
division.	303
(2) No statement that a person makes in an evaluation	304
ordered under division (F)(1) of this section or in a pretrial	305
hearing under divisions (C) to (E) of this section relating to	306
the person's serious mental illness at the time of the alleged	307
commission of the aggravated murder with which the person is	308
charged shall be used against the person on the issue of guilt	309
in any criminal action or proceeding, but, in a criminal action	310
or proceeding, the prosecutor or defense counsel may call as a	311
witness any examiner who evaluated the person or prepared a	312
report pursuant to a referral under this section. Neither the	313
appointment nor the testimony of an examiner in an evaluation	314
ordered under division (F)(1) of this section precludes the	315
prosecutor or defense counsel from calling other witnesses or	316

presenting other evidence on the issue of the person's serious	317
mental illness at the time of the alleged commission of the	318
aggravated murder or on competency or insanity issues.	319
(G) A person's pleading of not quilty by reason of	320
insanity or incompetence to stand trial, or a finding after such	321
a plea that the person is not insane or that the person is	322
competent to stand trial, does not preclude the person from	323
raising the matter of the person's serious mental illness at the	324
time of the alleged commission of the offense pursuant to	325
division (C) of this section and, if a person so raises that	326
matter, does not limit or affect any of the procedures described	327
in this section or the authority of a court to make any finding	328
described in this section.	329
Sec. 2929.03. (A) If the indictment or count in the	330
indictment charging aggravated murder does not contain one or	331
more specifications of aggravating circumstances listed in	332
division (A) of section 2929.04 of the Revised Code, then,	333
following a verdict of guilty of the charge of aggravated	334
murder, the trial court shall impose sentence on the offender as	335
follows:	336
(1) Except as provided in division (A)(2) of this section,	337
the trial court shall impose one of the following sentences on	338
the offender:	339
(a) Life imprisonment without parole;	340
(b) Subject to division (A)(1)(e) of this section, life	341
imprisonment with parole eligibility after serving twenty years	342
of imprisonment;	343
(c) Subject to division (A)(1)(e) of this section, life	344
imprisonment with parole eligibility after serving twenty-five	345

full years of imprisonment;	346
(d) Subject to division (A)(1)(e) of this section, life	347
imprisonment with parole eligibility after serving thirty full	348
years of imprisonment;	349
(e) If the victim of the aggravated murder was less than	350
thirteen years of age, the offender also is convicted of or	351
pleads guilty to a sexual motivation specification that was	352
included in the indictment, count in the indictment, or	353
information charging the offense, and the trial court does not	354
impose a sentence of life imprisonment without parole on the	355
offender pursuant to division (A)(1)(a) of this section, the	356
trial court shall sentence the offender pursuant to division (B)	357
(3) of section 2971.03 of the Revised Code to an indefinite term	358
consisting of a minimum term of thirty years and a maximum term	359
of life imprisonment that shall be served pursuant to that	360
section.	361
(2) If the offender also is convicted of or pleads guilty	362
to a sexual motivation specification and a sexually violent	363
predator specification that are included in the indictment,	364
count in the indictment, or information that charged the	365
aggravated murder, the trial court shall impose upon the	366
offender a sentence of life imprisonment without parole that	367
shall be served pursuant to section 2971.03 of the Revised Code.	368
(B) If the indictment or count in the indictment charging	369
aggravated murder contains one or more specifications of	370
aggravating circumstances listed in division (A) of section	371
2929.04 of the Revised Code, the verdict shall separately state	372
whether all of the following:	373
(1) Whether the accused is found guilty or not guilty of	374

the principal charge and, if;	375
(2) If guilty of the principal charge, whether the	376
offender was eighteen years of age or older at the time of the	377
commission of the offense $_{m{ au}}$ if the matter of age was raised by	378
the offender pursuant to section 2929.023 of the Revised Code,—	379
and whether;	380
(3) If guilty of the principal charge, whether the	381
offender was found under section 2929.025 of the Revised Code to	382
be ineligible for a sentence of death due to serious mental	383
illness if the matter of serious mental illness at the time of	384
the commission of the offense was raised by the offender	385
pursuant to that section;	386
(4) If quilty of the principal charge, whether the	387
offender is guilty or not guilty of each specification. The	388
The jury shall be instructed on its duties in this regard.	389
The instruction to the jury shall include an instruction that a	390
specification shall be proved beyond a reasonable doubt in order	391
to support a guilty verdict on the specification, but the	392
instruction shall not mention the penalty that may be the	393
consequence of a guilty or not guilty verdict on any charge or	394
specification.	395
(C)(1) If the indictment or count in the indictment	396
charging aggravated murder contains one or more specifications	397
of aggravating circumstances listed in division (A) of section	398
2929.04 of the Revised Code, then, following a verdict of guilty	399
of the charge but not guilty of each of the specifications, and	400
regardless of whether the offender raised the matter of age	401
pursuant to section 2929.023 of the Revised Code or the matter	402
of serious mental illness at the time of the commission of the	403

offense pursuant to section 2929.025 of the Revised Code, the	404
trial court shall impose sentence on the offender as follows:	405
(a) Except as provided in division (C)(1)(b) of this	406
section, the trial court shall impose one of the following	407
sentences on the offender:	408
(i) Life imprisonment without parole;	409
(ii) Subject to division (C)(1)(a)(v) of this section,	410
life imprisonment with parole eligibility after serving twenty	411
years of imprisonment;	412
(iii) Subject to division (C)(1)(a)(v) of this section,	413
life imprisonment with parole eligibility after serving twenty-	414
five full years of imprisonment;	415
(iv) Subject to division (C)(1)(a)(v) of this section,	416
life imprisonment with parole eligibility after serving thirty	417
full years of imprisonment;	418
(v) If the victim of the aggravated murder was less than	419
thirteen years of age, the offender also is convicted of or	420
pleads guilty to a sexual motivation specification that was	421
included in the indictment, count in the indictment, or	422
information charging the offense, and the trial court does not	423
impose a sentence of life imprisonment without parole on the	424
offender pursuant to division (C)(1)(a)(i) of this section, the	425
trial court shall sentence the offender pursuant to division (B)	426
(3) of section 2971.03 of the Revised Code to an indefinite term	427
consisting of a minimum term of thirty years and a maximum term	428
of life imprisonment.	429
(b) If the offender also is convicted of or pleads guilty	430
to a sexual motivation specification and a sexually violent	431
predator specification that are included in the indictment.	432

count in the indictment, or information that charged the	433
aggravated murder, the trial court shall impose upon the	434
offender a sentence of life imprisonment without parole that	435
shall be served pursuant to section 2971.03 of the Revised Code.	436
(2)(a) If the indictment or count in the indictment	437
contains one or more specifications of aggravating circumstances	438
listed in division (A) of section 2929.04 of the Revised Code	439
and if the offender is found guilty of both the charge and one	440
or more of the specifications, the penalty to be imposed on the	441
offender shall be one of the following:	442
(i) Except as provided in division (C)(2)(a)(ii) or (iii),	443
and subject to divisions (D)(1) and (E) of this section, the	444
penalty to be imposed on the offender shall be death, life	445
imprisonment without parole, life imprisonment with parole	446
eligibility after serving twenty-five full years of	447
imprisonment, or life imprisonment with parole eligibility after	448
serving thirty full years of imprisonment.	449
(ii) Except as provided in division (C)(2)(a)(iii) of this	450
section, if the victim of the aggravated murder was less than	451
thirteen years of age, the offender also is convicted of or	452
pleads guilty to a sexual motivation specification that was	453
included in the indictment, count in the indictment, or	454
information charging the offense, and the trial court does not	455
impose a sentence of death or life imprisonment without parole	456
on the offender pursuant to division (C)(2)(a)(i) of this	457
section, the penalty to be imposed on the offender shall be an	458
indefinite term consisting of a minimum term of thirty years and	459
a maximum term of life imprisonment that shall be imposed	460
pursuant to division (B)(3) of section 2971.03 of the Revised	461
Code and served pursuant to that section.	462

(iii) If the offender also is convicted of or pleads	463
guilty to a sexual motivation specification and a sexually	464
violent predator specification that are included in the	465
indictment, count in the indictment, or information that charged	466
the aggravated murder, the penalty to be imposed on the offender	467
shall be death or life imprisonment without parole that shall be	468
served pursuant to section 2971.03 of the Revised Code.	469
(b) A penalty imposed pursuant to division (C)(2)(a)(i),	470
(ii), or (iii) of this section shall be determined pursuant to	471
divisions (D) and (E) of this section and shall be determined by	472
one of the following:	473
(i) By the panel of three judges that tried the offender	474
upon the offender's waiver of the right to trial by jury;	475
(ii) By the trial jury and the trial judge, if the	476
offender was tried by jury.	477
(D)(1) Death may not be imposed as a penalty for	478
aggravated murder if the offender raised the matter of age at	479
trial pursuant to section 2929.023 of the Revised Code and was	480
not found at trial to have been eighteen years of age or older	481
at the time of the commission of the offense or raised the	482
matter of the offender's serious mental illness at the time of	483
the commission of the offense pursuant to section 2929.025 of	484
the Revised Code and was found under that section to be	485
ineligible for a sentence of death due to serious mental	486
illness. When death may be imposed as a penalty for aggravated	487
murder, the court shall proceed under this division. When death	488
may be imposed as a penalty, the court, upon the request of the	489
defendant, shall require a pre-sentence investigation to be made	490
and, upon the request of the defendant, shall require a mental	491
examination to be made, and shall require reports of the	492

investigation and of any mental examination submitted to the	493
court, pursuant to section 2947.06 of the Revised Code. No	494
statement made or information provided by a defendant in a	495
mental examination or proceeding conducted pursuant to this	496
division shall be disclosed to any person, except as provided in	497
this division, or be used in evidence against the defendant on	498
the issue of guilt in any retrial. A pre-sentence investigation	499
or mental examination shall not be made except upon request of	500
the defendant. Copies of any reports prepared under this	501
division shall be furnished to the court, to the trial jury if	502
the offender was tried by a jury, to the prosecutor, and to the	503
offender or the offender's counsel for use under this division.	504
The court, and the trial jury if the offender was tried by a	505
jury, shall consider any report prepared pursuant to this	506
division and furnished to it and any evidence raised at trial	507
that is relevant to the aggravating circumstances the offender	508
was found guilty of committing or to any factors in mitigation	509
of the imposition of the sentence of death, shall hear testimony	510
and other evidence that is relevant to the nature and	511
circumstances of the aggravating circumstances the offender was	512
found guilty of committing, the mitigating factors set forth in	513
division (B) of section 2929.04 of the Revised Code, and any	514
other factors in mitigation of the imposition of the sentence of	515
death, and shall hear the statement, if any, of the offender,	516
and the arguments, if any, of counsel for the defense and	517
prosecution, that are relevant to the penalty that should be	518
imposed on the offender. The defendant shall be given great	519
latitude in the presentation of evidence of the mitigating	520
factors set forth in division (B) of section 2929.04 of the	521
Revised Code and of any other factors in mitigation of the	522
imposition of the sentence of death. If the offender chooses to	523
make a statement, the offender is subject to cross-examination	524

only if the offender consents to make the statement under oath	525
or affirmation.	526
The defendant shall have the burden of going forward with	527
the evidence of any factors in mitigation of the imposition of	528
the sentence of death. The prosecution shall have the burden of	529
proving, by proof beyond a reasonable doubt, that the	530
aggravating circumstances the defendant was found guilty of	531
committing are sufficient to outweigh the factors in mitigation	532
of the imposition of the sentence of death.	533
of the imposition of the sentence of death.	555
(2) Upon consideration of the relevant evidence raised at	534
trial, the testimony, other evidence, statement of the offender,	535
arguments of counsel, and, if applicable, the reports submitted	536
pursuant to division (D)(1) of this section, the trial jury, if	537
the offender was tried by a jury, shall determine whether the	538
aggravating circumstances the offender was found guilty of	539
committing are sufficient to outweigh the mitigating factors	540
present in the case. If the trial jury unanimously finds, by	541
proof beyond a reasonable doubt, that the aggravating	542
circumstances the offender was found guilty of committing	543
outweigh the mitigating factors, the trial jury shall recommend	544
to the court that the sentence of death be imposed on the	545
offender. Absent such a finding, the jury shall recommend that	546
the offender be sentenced to one of the following:	547
(a) Except as provided in division (D)(2)(b) or (c) of	548
this section, to life imprisonment without parole, life	549
imprisonment with parole eligibility after serving twenty-five	550
full years of imprisonment, or life imprisonment with parole	551
eligibility after serving thirty full years of imprisonment;	552
(b) Except as provided in division (D)(2)(c) of this	553

section, if the victim of the aggravated murder was less than

thirteen years of age, the offender also is convicted of or	555
pleads guilty to a sexual motivation specification that was	556
included in the indictment, count in the indictment, or	557
information charging the offense, and the jury does not	558
recommend a sentence of life imprisonment without parole	559
pursuant to division (D)(2)(a) of this section, to an indefinite	560
term consisting of a minimum term of thirty years and a maximum	561
term of life imprisonment to be imposed pursuant to division (B)	562
(3) of section 2971.03 of the Revised Code and served pursuant	563
to that section.	564

(c) If the offender also is convicted of or pleads guilty 565 to a sexual motivation specification and a sexually violent 566 predator specification that are included in the indictment, 567 count in the indictment, or information that charged the 568 aggravated murder, to life imprisonment without parole. 569

If the trial jury recommends that the offender be 570 sentenced to life imprisonment without parole, life imprisonment 571 with parole eligibility after serving twenty-five full years of 572 imprisonment, life imprisonment with parole eligibility after 573 serving thirty full years of imprisonment, or an indefinite term 574 consisting of a minimum term of thirty years and a maximum term 575 of life imprisonment to be imposed pursuant to division (B)(3) 576 of section 2971.03 of the Revised Code, the court shall impose 577 the sentence recommended by the jury upon the offender. If the 578 sentence is an indefinite term consisting of a minimum term of 579 thirty years and a maximum term of life imprisonment imposed as 580 described in division (D)(2)(b) of this section or a sentence of 581 life imprisonment without parole imposed under division (D)(2) 582 (c) of this section, the sentence shall be served pursuant to 583 section 2971.03 of the Revised Code. If the trial jury 584 recommends that the sentence of death be imposed upon the 585

offender, the court shall proceed to impose sentence pursuant to	586
division (D)(3) of this section.	587
(3) Upon consideration of the relevant evidence raised at	588
trial, the testimony, other evidence, statement of the offender,	589
arguments of counsel, and, if applicable, the reports submitted	590
to the court pursuant to division (D)(1) of this section, if,	591
after receiving pursuant to division (D)(2) of this section the	592
trial jury's recommendation that the sentence of death be	593
imposed, the court finds, by proof beyond a reasonable doubt, or	594
if the panel of three judges unanimously finds, by proof beyond	595
a reasonable doubt, that the aggravating circumstances the	596
offender was found guilty of committing outweigh the mitigating	597
factors, it shall impose sentence of death on the offender.	598
Absent such a finding by the court or panel, the court or the	599
panel shall impose one of the following sentences on the	600
offender:	601
(a) Except as provided in division (D)(3)(b) of this	602
section, one of the following:	603
(i) Life imprisonment without parole;	604
(ii) Subject to division (D)(3)(a)(iv) of this section,	605
life imprisonment with parole eligibility after serving twenty-	606
five full years of imprisonment;	607
(iii) Subject to division (D)(3)(a)(iv) of this section,	608
life imprisonment with parole eligibility after serving thirty	609
full years of imprisonment;	610
(iv) If the victim of the aggravated murder was less than	611
thirteen years of age, the offender also is convicted of or	612
pleads guilty to a sexual motivation specification that was	613
included in the indictment, count in the indictment, or	614

H. B. No. 136
Page 22
As Introduced

information charging the offense, and the trial court does not	615
impose a sentence of life imprisonment without parole on the	616
offender pursuant to division (D)(3)(a)(i) of this section, the	617
court or panel shall sentence the offender pursuant to division	618
(B)(3) of section 2971.03 of the Revised Code to an indefinite	619
term consisting of a minimum term of thirty years and a maximum	620
term of life imprisonment.	621
(b) If the offender also is convicted of or pleads guilty	622
to a sexual motivation specification and a sexually violent	623
predator specification that are included in the indictment,	624
count in the indictment, or information that charged the	625
aggravated murder, life imprisonment without parole that shall	626
be served pursuant to section 2971.03 of the Revised Code.	627
(E) If the offender raised the matter of age at trial	628
pursuant to section 2929.023 of the Revised Code, was convicted	629
of aggravated murder and one or more specifications of an	630
aggravating circumstance listed in division (A) of section	631
2929.04 of the Revised Code, <u>and if the offender either raised</u>	632
the matter of age at trial pursuant to section 2929.023 of the	633
Revised Code and was not found at trial to have been eighteen	634
years of age or older at the time of the commission of the	635
offense or raised the matter of the offender's serious mental	636
illness at the time of the commission of the offense pursuant to	637
section 2929.025 of the Revised Code and was found under that	638
section to be ineligible for a sentence of death due to serious	639
mental illness, the court or the panel of three judges shall not	640
impose a sentence of death on the offender. Instead, the court	641
or panel shall impose one of the following sentences on the	642
offender:	643

(1) Except as provided in division (E)(2) of this section,

one of the following:	645
(a) Life imprisonment without parole;	646
(b) Subject to division (E) $\frac{(2)}{(1)}$ (d) of this section, life	647
imprisonment with parole eligibility after serving twenty-five	648
full years of imprisonment;	649
(c) Subject to division (E) $\frac{(2)}{(1)}$ (d) of this section, life	650
imprisonment with parole eligibility after serving thirty full	651
years of imprisonment;	652
(d) If the victim of the aggravated murder was less than	653
thirteen years of age, the offender also is convicted of or	654
pleads guilty to a sexual motivation specification that was	655
included in the indictment, count in the indictment, or	656
information charging the offense, and the trial court does not	657
impose a sentence of life imprisonment without parole on the	658
offender pursuant to division (E) $\frac{(2)}{(1)}$ (a) of this section, the	659
court or panel shall sentence the offender pursuant to division	660
(B)(3) of section 2971.03 of the Revised Code to an indefinite	661
term consisting of a minimum term of thirty years and a maximum	662
term of life imprisonment.	663
(2) If the offender also is convicted of or pleads guilty	664
to a sexual motivation specification and a sexually violent	665
predator specification that are included in the indictment,	666
count in the indictment, or information that charged the	667
aggravated murder, life imprisonment without parole that shall	668
be served pursuant to section 2971.03 of the Revised Code.	669
(F) The court or the panel of three judges, when it	670
imposes sentence of death, shall state in a separate opinion its	671
specific findings as to the existence of any of the mitigating	672
factors set forth in division (B) of section 2929.04 of the	673

H. B. No. 136
Page 24
As Introduced

Revised Code, the existence of any other mitigating factors, the	674
aggravating circumstances the offender was found guilty of	675
committing, and the reasons why the aggravating circumstances	676
the offender was found guilty of committing were sufficient to	677
outweigh the mitigating factors. The court or panel, when it	678
imposes life imprisonment or an indefinite term consisting of a	679
minimum term of thirty years and a maximum term of life	680
imprisonment under division (D) of this section, shall state in	681
a separate opinion its specific findings of which of the	682
mitigating factors set forth in division (B) of section 2929.04	683
of the Revised Code it found to exist, what other mitigating	684
factors it found to exist, what aggravating circumstances the	685
offender was found guilty of committing, and why it could not	686
find that these aggravating circumstances were sufficient to	687
outweigh the mitigating factors. For cases in which a sentence	688
of death is imposed for an offense committed before January 1,	689
1995, the court or panel shall file the opinion required to be	690
prepared by this division with the clerk of the appropriate	691
court of appeals and with the clerk of the supreme court within	692
fifteen days after the court or panel imposes sentence. For	693
cases in which a sentence of death is imposed for an offense	694
committed on or after January 1, 1995, the court or panel shall	695
file the opinion required to be prepared by this division with	696
the clerk of the supreme court within fifteen days after the	697
court or panel imposes sentence. The judgment in a case in which	698
a sentencing hearing is held pursuant to this section is not	699
final until the opinion is filed.	700

(G) (1) Whenever the court or a panel of three judges 701 imposes a sentence of death for an offense committed before 702 January 1, 1995, the clerk of the court in which the judgment is 703 rendered shall make and retain a copy of the entire record in 704

the case, and shall deliver the original of the entire record in	705
the case to the appellate court.	706
(2) Whenever the court or a panel of three judges imposes	707
a sentence of death for an offense committed on or after January	708
1, 1995, the clerk of the court in which the judgment is	709
rendered shall make and retain a copy of the entire record in	710
the case, and shall deliver the original of the entire record in	711
the case to the supreme court.	712
Sec. 2929.04. (A) Imposition of the death penalty for	713
aggravated murder is precluded unless one or more of the	714
following is specified in the indictment or count in the	715
indictment pursuant to section 2941.14 of the Revised Code and	716
proved beyond a reasonable doubt:	717
(1) The offense was the assassination of the president of	718
the United States or a person in line of succession to the	719
presidency, the governor or lieutenant governor of this state,	720
the president-elect or vice president-elect of the United	721
States, the governor-elect or lieutenant governor-elect of this	722
state, or a candidate for any of the offices described in this	723
division. For purposes of this division, a person is a candidate	724
if the person has been nominated for election according to law,	725
if the person has filed a petition or petitions according to law	726
to have the person's name placed on the ballot in a primary or	727
general election, or if the person campaigns as a write-in	728
candidate in a primary or general election.	729
(2) The offense was committed for hire.	730

(3) The offense was committed for the purpose of escaping

detection, apprehension, trial, or punishment for another

offense committed by the offender.

731

732

(4) The offense was committed while the offender was under	734
detention or while the offender was at large after having broken	735
detention. As used in division (A)(4) of this section,	736
"detention" has the same meaning as in section 2921.01 of the	737
Revised Code, except that detention does not include	738
hospitalization, institutionalization, or confinement in a	739
mental health facility or intellectual disabilities facility	740
unless at the time of the commission of the offense either of	741
the following circumstances apply:	742
(a) The offender was in the facility as a result of being	743
charged with a violation of a section of the Revised Code.	744
(b) The offender was under detention as a result of being	745
convicted of or pleading guilty to a violation of a section of	746
the Revised Code.	747
(5) Prior to the offense at bar, the offender was	748
convicted of an offense an essential element of which was the	749
purposeful killing of or attempt to kill another, or the offense	750
at bar was part of a course of conduct involving the purposeful	751
killing of or attempt to kill two or more persons by the	752
offender.	753
(6) The victim of the offense was a law enforcement	754
officer, as defined in section 2911.01 of the Revised Code, whom	755
the offender had reasonable cause to know or knew to be a law	756
enforcement officer as so defined, and either the victim, at the	757
time of the commission of the offense, was engaged in the	758
victim's duties, or it was the offender's specific purpose to	759
kill a law enforcement officer as so defined.	760
(7) The offense was committed while the offender was	761

committing, attempting to commit, or fleeing immediately after

committing or attempting to commit kidnapping, rape, aggravated arson, aggravated robbery, or aggravated burglary, and either the offender was the principal offender in the commission of the aggravated murder or, if not the principal offender, committed the aggravated murder with prior calculation and design.

- (8) The victim of the aggravated murder was a witness to an offense who was purposely killed to prevent the victim's testimony in any criminal proceeding and the aggravated murder was not committed during the commission, attempted commission, or flight immediately after the commission or attempted commission of the offense to which the victim was a witness, or the victim of the aggravated murder was a witness to an offense and was purposely killed in retaliation for the victim's testimony in any criminal proceeding.
- (9) The offender, in the commission of the offense, purposefully caused the death of another who was under thirteen years of age at the time of the commission of the offense, and either the offender was the principal offender in the commission of the offense or, if not the principal offender, committed the offense with prior calculation and design.
- (10) The offense was committed while the offender was committing, attempting to commit, or fleeing immediately after committing or attempting to commit terrorism.
- (B) If one or more of the aggravating circumstances listed

 786
 in division (A) of this section is specified in the indictment
 or count in the indictment and proved beyond a reasonable doubt,

 787
 and—if the offender did not raise the matter of age pursuant to

 789
 section 2929.023 of the Revised Code or if—the offender, after
 790
 raising the—that matter of age, was found at trial to have been
 791
 eighteen years of age or older at the time of the commission of

the offense, <u>and if the offender did not raise the matter of the</u>	793
offender's serious mental illness at the time of the commission	794
of the offense pursuant to section 2929.025 of the Revised Code	795
or the offender after raising that matter was found by the court	796
to not be ineligible for a sentence of death, the court, trial	797
jury, or panel of three judges shall consider, and weigh against	798
the aggravating circumstances proved beyond a reasonable doubt,	799
the nature and circumstances of the offense, the history,	800
character, and background of the offender, and all of the	801
following factors:	802
(1) Whether the victim of the offense induced or	803
facilitated it;	804
(2) Whether it is unlikely that the offense would have	805
been committed, but for the fact that the offender was under	806
duress, coercion, or strong provocation;	807
(3) Whether, at the time of committing the offense, the	808
offender, because of a mental disease or defect, lacked	809
substantial capacity to appreciate the criminality of the	810
offender's conduct or to conform the offender's conduct to the	811
requirements of the law;	812
(4) The youth of the offender;	813
(5) The offender's lack of a significant history of prior	814
criminal convictions and delinquency adjudications;	815
(6) If the offender was a participant in the offense but	816
not the principal offender, the degree of the offender's	817
participation in the offense and the degree of the offender's	818
participation in the acts that led to the death of the victim;	819
(7) Any other factors that are relevant to the issue of	820
whether the offender should be sentenced to death.	821

(C) The defendant shall be given great latitude in the	822
presentation of evidence of the factors listed in division (B)	823
of this section and of any other factors in mitigation of the	824
imposition of the sentence of death.	825
The existence of any of the mitigating factors listed in	826
division (B) of this section does not preclude the imposition of	827
a sentence of death on the offender but shall be weighed	828
pursuant to divisions (D)(2) and (3) of section 2929.03 of the	829
Revised Code by the trial court, trial jury, or the panel of	830
three judges against the aggravating circumstances the offender	831
was found guilty of committing.	832
Sec. 2929.06. (A) (1) If a sentence of death imposed upon	833
an offender is set aside, nullified, or vacated because the, or	834
voided for any of the following reasons, the trial court that	835
sentenced the offender shall conduct a hearing to resentence the	836
offender in accordance with division (A)(2) of this section:	837
(a) The court of appeals, in a case in which a sentence of	838
death was imposed for an offense committed before January 1,	839
1995, or the supreme court, in cases <u>a case</u> in which the supreme	840
court reviews the sentence upon appeal, could not affirm the	841
sentence of death under the standards imposed by section 2929.05	842
of the Revised Code, is set aside, nullified, or vacated for	843
the.	844
(b) The sole reason that the statutory procedure for	845
imposing the sentence of death that is set forth in sections	846
2929.03 and 2929.04 of the Revised Code is unconstitutional $ au_{ au}$	847
(c) The sentence of death is set aside, nullified, or	848
vacated pursuant to division (C) of section 2929.05 of the	849
Revised Code, or is set aside, nullified, or vacated because a.	850

$\underline{\text{(d) A}}$ court has determined that the offender is a person	851
with an intellectual disability under standards set forth in	852
decisions of the supreme court of this state or the United	853
States supreme court, the trial court that sentenced the	854
offender shall conduct a hearing to resentence the offender.	855
(e) The sentence of death is voided by a court pursuant to	856
division (H) of section 2953.21 of the Revised Code.	857
(2) At the a resentencing hearing conducted under division	858
(A)(1) of this section, the court shall impose upon the offender	859
a sentence of life imprisonment or an indefinite term consisting	860
of a minimum term of thirty years and a maximum term of life	861
imprisonment that is determined as specified in this division.	862
If division (D) of section 2929.03 of the Revised Code, at the	863
time the offender committed the aggravated murder for which the	864
sentence of death was imposed, required the imposition when a	865
sentence of death was not imposed of a sentence of life	866
imprisonment without parole or a sentence of an indefinite term	867
consisting of a minimum term of thirty years and a maximum term	868
of life imprisonment to be imposed pursuant to division (A) or	869
(B)(3) of section 2971.03 of the Revised Code and served	870
pursuant to that section, the court shall impose the sentence so	871
required. In all other cases, the sentences of life imprisonment	872
that are available at the hearing, and from which the court	873
shall impose sentence, shall be the same sentences of life	874
imprisonment that were available under division (D) of section	875
2929.03 or under section 2909.24 of the Revised Code at the time	876
the offender committed the offense for which the sentence of	877
death was imposed. Nothing in this division regarding the	878
resentencing of an offender shall affect the operation of	879
section 2971.03 of the Revised Code.	880

(B) Whenever any court of this state or any federal court	881
sets aside, nullifies, or vacates a sentence of death imposed	882
upon an offender because of error that occurred in the	883
sentencing phase of the trial and if division (A) of this	884
section does not apply, the trial court that sentenced the	885
offender shall conduct a new hearing to resentence the offender.	886
If the offender was tried by a jury, the trial court shall	887
impanel a new jury for the hearing. If the offender was tried by	888
a panel of three judges, that panel or, if necessary, a new	889
panel of three judges shall conduct the hearing. At the hearing,	890
the court or panel shall follow the procedure set forth in	891
division (D) of section 2929.03 of the Revised Code in	892
determining whether to impose upon the offender a sentence of	893
death, a sentence of life imprisonment, or an indefinite term	894
consisting of a minimum term of thirty years and a maximum term	895
of life imprisonment. If, pursuant to that procedure, the court	896
or panel determines that it will impose a sentence other than a	897
sentence of death, the court or panel shall impose upon the	898
offender one of the sentences of life imprisonment that could	899
have been imposed at the time the offender committed the offense	900
for which the sentence of death was imposed, determined as	901
specified in this division, or an indefinite term consisting of	902
a minimum term of thirty years and a maximum term of life	903
imprisonment that is determined as specified in this division.	904
If division (D) of section 2929.03 of the Revised Code, at the	905
time the offender committed the aggravated murder for which the	906
sentence of death was imposed, required the imposition when a	907
sentence of death was not imposed of a sentence of life	908
imprisonment without parole or a sentence of an indefinite term	909
consisting of a minimum term of thirty years and a maximum term	910
of life imprisonment to be imposed pursuant to division (A) or	911
(B)(3) of section 2971.03 of the Revised Code and served	912

H. B. No. 136
Page 32
As Introduced

pursuant to that section, the court or panel shall impose the	913
sentence so required. In all other cases, the sentences of life	914
imprisonment that are available at the hearing, and from which	915
the court or panel shall impose sentence, shall be the same	916
sentences of life imprisonment that were available under	917
division (D) of section 2929.03 or under section 2909.24 of the	918
Revised Code at the time the offender committed the offense for	919
which the sentence of death was imposed.	920

- (C) If a sentence of life imprisonment without parole 921 922 imposed upon an offender pursuant to section 2929.021 or 2929.03 of the Revised Code is set aside, nullified, or vacated for the 923 sole reason that the statutory procedure for imposing the 924 sentence of life imprisonment without parole that is set forth 925 in sections 2929.03 and 2929.04 of the Revised Code is 926 unconstitutional, the trial court that sentenced the offender 927 shall conduct a hearing to resentence the offender to life 928 imprisonment with parole eligibility after serving twenty-five 929 full years of imprisonment or to life imprisonment with parole 930 eligibility after serving thirty full years of imprisonment. 931
- (D) Nothing in this section limits or restricts the rights 932 of the state to appeal any order setting aside, nullifying, or 933 vacating a conviction or sentence of death, when an appeal of 934 that nature otherwise would be available. 935
- (E) This section, as amended by H.B. 184 of the 125th

 general assembly, shall apply to all offenders who have been

 937

 sentenced to death for an aggravated murder that was committed

 938

 on or after October 19, 1981, or for terrorism that was

 939

 committed on or after May 15, 2002. This section, as amended by

 H.B. 184 of the 125th general assembly, shall apply equally to

 941

 all such offenders sentenced to death prior to, on, or after

March 23, 2005, including offenders who, on March 23, 2005, are	943
challenging their sentence of death and offenders whose sentence	944
of death has been set aside, nullified, or vacated by any court	945
of this state or any federal court but who, as of March 23,	946
2005, have not yet been resentenced.	947
Sec. 2953.21. (A) (1) (a) A person in any of the following	948
categories may file a petition in the court that imposed	949
sentence, stating the grounds for relief relied upon, and asking	950
the court to vacate or set aside the judgment or sentence or to	951
<pre>grant other appropriate relief:</pre>	952
(i) Any person who has been convicted of a criminal	953
offense or adjudicated a delinquent child and who claims that	954
there was such a denial or infringement of the person's rights	955
as to render the judgment void or voidable under the Ohio	956
Constitution or the Constitution of the United States, any;	957
(ii) Any person who has been convicted of a criminal	958
offense and sentenced to death and who claims that there was a	959
denial or infringement of the person's rights under either of	960
those Constitutions that creates a reasonable probability of an	961
altered verdict, and any;	962
(iii) Any person who has been convicted of a criminal	963
offense that is a felony and who is an offender for whom DNA	964
testing that was performed under sections 2953.71 to 2953.81 of	965
the Revised Code or under former section 2953.82 of the Revised	966
Code and analyzed in the context of and upon consideration of	967
all available admissible evidence related to the person's case	968
as described in division (D) of section 2953.74 of the Revised	969
Code provided results that establish, by clear and convincing	970
evidence, actual innocence of that felony offense or, if the	971
person was sentenced to death, establish, by clear and	972

convincing evidence, actual innocence of the aggravating	973
circumstance or circumstances the person was found guilty of	974
committing and that is or are the basis of that sentence of	975
death, may file a petition in the court that imposed sentence,	976
stating the grounds for relief relied upon, and asking the court	977
to vacate or set aside the judgment or sentence or to grant	978
other appropriate relief;	979
(iv) Any person who has been convicted of aggravated	980
murder and sentenced to death for the offense and who claims	981
that the person had a serious mental illness at the time of the	982
commission of the offense and that as a result the court should	983
render void the sentence of death.	984
The (b) A petitioner under division (A)(1)(a) of this	985
<pre>section may file a supporting affidavit and other documentary</pre>	986
evidence in support of the claim for relief.	987
$\frac{\text{(b)}(c)}{\text{(c)}}$ As used in division (A)(1)(a) of this section,	988
"actual:	989
(i) "Actual innocence" means that, had the results of the	990
DNA testing conducted under sections 2953.71 to 2953.81 of the	991
Revised Code or under former section 2953.82 of the Revised Code	992
been presented at trial, and had those results been analyzed in	993
the context of and upon consideration of all available	994
admissible evidence related to the person's case as described in	995
division (D) of section 2953.74 of the Revised Code, no	996
reasonable factfinder would have found the petitioner guilty of	997
the offense of which the petitioner was convicted, or, if the	998
person was sentenced to death, no reasonable factfinder would	999
have found the petitioner guilty of the aggravating circumstance	1000
or circumstances the petitioner was found guilty of committing	1001
and that is or are the basis of that sentence of death.	1002

(ii) "Serious mental illness" has the same meaning as in	1003
section 2929.025 of the Revised Code.	1004
$\frac{(c)(d)}{(d)}$ As used in divisions (A)(1)(a) and $\frac{(b)(c)}{(c)}$ of this	1005
section, "former section 2953.82 of the Revised Code" means	1006
section 2953.82 of the Revised Code as it existed prior to July	1007
6, 2010.	1008
(d)(e) At any time in conjunction with the filing of a	1009
petition for postconviction relief under division (A) of this	1010
section by a person who has been sentenced to death, or with the	1011
litigation of a petition so filed, the court, for good cause	1012
shown, may authorize the petitioner in seeking the	1013
postconviction relief and the prosecuting attorney of the county	1014
served by the court in defending the proceeding, to take	1015
depositions and to issue subpoenas and subpoenas duces tecum in	1016
accordance with divisions (A)(1) $\frac{(d)(e)}{(e)}$, (A)(1) $\frac{(e)(f)}{(e)}$, and (C) of	1017
this section, and to any other form of discovery as in a civil	1018
action that the court in its discretion permits. The court may	1019
limit the extent of discovery under this division. In addition	1020
to discovery that is relevant to the claim and was available	1021
under Criminal Rule 16 through conclusion of the original	1022
criminal trial, the court, for good cause shown, may authorize	1023
the petitioner or prosecuting attorney to take depositions and	1024
issue subpoenas and subpoenas duces tecum in either of the	1025
following circumstances:	1026
(i) For any witness who testified at trial or who was	1027
disclosed by the state prior to trial, except as otherwise	1028
provided in this division, the petitioner or prosecuting	1029
attorney shows clear and convincing evidence that the witness is	1030
material and that a deposition of the witness or the issuing of	1031
a subpoena or subpoena duces tecum is of assistance in order to	1032

substantiate or refute the petitioner's claim that there is a	1033
reasonable probability of an altered verdict. This division does	1034
not apply if the witness was unavailable for trial or would not	1035
voluntarily be interviewed by the defendant or prosecuting	1036
attorney.	1037
(ii) For any witness with respect to whom division (A)(1)	1038
(d) (e) (i) of this section does not apply, the petitioner or	1039
prosecuting attorney shows good cause that the witness is	1040
material and that a deposition of the witness or the issuing of	1041
a subpoena or subpoena duces tecum is of assistance in order to	1042
substantiate or refute the petitioner's claim that there is a	1043
reasonable probability of an altered verdict.	1044
(e)(f) If a person who has been sentenced to death and who	1045
files a petition for postconviction relief under division (A) of	1046
this section requests postconviction discovery as described in	1047
division (A)(1) $\frac{(d)(e)}{(e)}$ of this section or if the prosecuting	1048
attorney of the county served by the court requests	1049
postconviction discovery as described in that division, within	1050
ten days after the docketing of the request, or within any other	1051
time that the court sets for good cause shown, the prosecuting	1052
attorney shall respond by answer or motion to the petitioner's	1053
request or the petitioner shall respond by answer or motion to	1054
the prosecuting attorney's request, whichever is applicable.	1055
(f)(g) If a person who has been sentenced to death and who	1056
files a petition for postconviction relief under division (A) of	1057
this section requests postconviction discovery as described in	1058
division (A)(1) $\frac{(d)}{(e)}$ of this section or if the prosecuting	1059
attorney of the county served by the court requests	1060
postconviction discovery as described in that division, upon	1061
motion by the petitioner, the prosecuting attorney, or the	1062

person from whom discovery is sought, and for good cause shown,	1063
the court in which the action is pending may make any order that	1064
justice requires to protect a party or person from oppression or	1065
undue burden or expense, including but not limited to the orders	1066
described in divisions (A)(1) $\frac{(g)}{(h)}$ (i) to (viii) of this	1067
section. The court also may make any such order if, in its	1068
discretion, it determines that the discovery sought would be	1069
irrelevant to the claims made in the petition; and if the court	1070
makes any such order on that basis, it shall explain in the	1071
order the reasons why the discovery would be irrelevant.	1072

(g)(h) If a petitioner, prosecuting attorney, or person 1073 from whom discovery is sought makes a motion for an order under 1074 division (A)(1) $\frac{f}{f}$ (q) of this section and the order is denied in 1075 whole or in part, the court, on terms and conditions as are 1076 just, may order that any party or person provide or permit 1077 discovery as described in division (A)(1) $\frac{d}{d}$ (e) of this section. 1078 The provisions of Civil Rule 37(A)(4) apply to the award of 1079 expenses incurred in relation to the motion, except that in no 1080 case shall a court require a petitioner who is indigent to pay 1081 expenses under those provisions. 1082

Before any person moves for an order under division (A)(1) 1083 $\frac{f}{g}$ of this section, that person shall make a reasonable 1084 effort to resolve the matter through discussion with the 1085 petitioner or prosecuting attorney seeking discovery. A motion 1086 for an order under division (A)(1) $\frac{f}{g}$ of this section shall 1087 be accompanied by a statement reciting the effort made to 1088 resolve the matter in accordance with this paragraph. 1089

The orders that may be made under division (A) $(1) \cdot (f) \cdot (g)$ of 1090 this section include, but are not limited to, any of the 1091 following:

(i) That the discovery not be had;	1093
(ii) That the discovery may be had only on specified terms	1094
and conditions, including a designation of the time or place;	1095
(iii) That the discovery may be had only by a method of	1096
discovery other than that selected by the party seeking	1097
discovery;	1098
(iv) That certain matters not be inquired into or that the	1099
scope of the discovery be limited to certain matters;	1100
(v) That discovery be conducted with no one present except	1101
persons designated by the court;	1102
(vi) That a deposition after being sealed be opened only	1103
by order of the court;	1104
(vii) That a trade secret or other confidential research,	1105
development, or commercial information not be disclosed or be	1106
disclosed only in a designated way;	1107
(viii) That the parties simultaneously file specified	1108
documents or information enclosed in sealed envelopes to be	1109
opened as directed by the court.	1110
(h)(i) Any postconviction discovery authorized under	1111
division (A)(1) $\frac{(d)(e)}{(e)}$ of this section shall be completed not	1112
later than eighteen months after the start of the discovery	1113
proceedings unless, for good cause shown, the court extends that	1114
period for completing the discovery.	1115
$\frac{(i)(j)}{(j)}$ Nothing in division (A)(1) $\frac{(d)(e)}{(e)}$ of this section	1116
authorizes, or shall be construed as authorizing, the	1117
relitigation, or discovery in support of relitigation, of any	1118
matter barred by the doctrine of res judicata.	1119

$\frac{(j)(k)}{(k)}$ Division (A)(1) of this section does not apply to	1120
any person who has been convicted of a criminal offense and	1121
sentenced to death and who has unsuccessfully raised the same	1122
claims in a petition for postconviction relief.	1123
(2) (a) Except as otherwise provided in section 2953.23 of	1124
the Revised Code, a petition under division (A)(1)(a)(i), (ii),	1125
or (iii) of this section shall be filed no later than three	1126
hundred sixty-five days after the date on which the trial	1127
transcript is filed in the court of appeals in the direct appeal	1128
of the judgment of conviction or adjudication or, if the direct	1129
appeal involves a sentence of death, the date on which the trial	1130
transcript is filed in the supreme court. If no appeal is taken,	1131
except as otherwise provided in section 2953.23 of the Revised	1132
Code, the petition shall be filed no later than three hundred	1133
sixty-five days after the expiration of the time for filing the	1134
appeal.	1135
(b) Except as otherwise provided in section 2953.23 of the	1136
Revised Code, a petition under division (A)(1)(a)(iv) of this	1137
section shall be filed not later than three hundred sixty-five	1138
days after the effective date of this amendment.	1139
(3) In a petition filed under division (A) $\underline{(1)(a)(i)}$, $\underline{(ii)}$,	1140
or (iii) of this section, a person who has been sentenced to	1141
death may ask the court to render void or voidable the judgment	1142
with respect to the conviction of aggravated murder or the	1143
specification of an aggravating circumstance or the sentence of	1144
death. A person sentenced to death who files a petition under	1145
division (A)(1)(a)(iv) of this section may ask the court to	1146
render void the sentence of death and to order the resentencing	1147
of the person under division (A) of section 2929.06 of the	1148
Revised Code.	1149

(4) A petitioner shall state in the original or amended	1150
petition filed under division (A) of this section all grounds	1151
for relief claimed by the petitioner. Except as provided in	1152
section 2953.23 of the Revised Code, any ground for relief that	1153
is not so stated in the petition is waived.	1154

- (5) If the petitioner in a petition filed under division 1155 (A) (1) (a) (i), (ii), or (iii) of this section was convicted of or 1156 pleaded quilty to a felony, the petition may include a claim 1157 that the petitioner was denied the equal protection of the laws 1158 in violation of the Ohio Constitution or the United States 1159 Constitution because the sentence imposed upon the petitioner 1160 for the felony was part of a consistent pattern of disparity in 1161 sentencing by the judge who imposed the sentence, with regard to 1162 the petitioner's race, gender, ethnic background, or religion. 1163 If the supreme court adopts a rule requiring a court of common 1164 pleas to maintain information with regard to an offender's race, 1165 gender, ethnic background, or religion, the supporting evidence 1166 for the petition shall include, but shall not be limited to, a 1167 copy of that type of information relative to the petitioner's 1168 sentence and copies of that type of information relative to 1169 1170 sentences that the same judge imposed upon other persons.
- (6) Notwithstanding any law or court rule to the contrary, 1171 there is no limit on the number of pages in, or on the length 1172 of, a petition filed under division (A)(1)(a)(i), (ii), (iii), 1173 or (iv) of this section by a person who has been sentenced to 1174 death. If any court rule specifies a limit on the number of 1175 pages in, or on the length of, a petition filed under division 1176 (A) (1) (a) (i), (ii), (iii), or (iv) of this section or on a 1177 prosecuting attorney's response to such a petition by answer or 1178 motion and a person who has been sentenced to death files a 1179 petition that exceeds the limit specified for the petition, the 1180

prosecuting attorney may respond by an answer or motion that	1181
exceeds the limit specified for the response.	1182
(B) The clerk of the court in which the petition for	1183
postconviction relief and, if applicable, a request for	1184
postconviction discovery described in division (A)(1) $\frac{(d)}{(e)}$ of	1185
this section is filed shall docket the petition and the request	1186
and bring them promptly to the attention of the court. The clerk	1187
of the court in which the petition for postconviction relief	1188
and, if applicable, a request for postconviction discovery	1189
described in division (A)(1) $\frac{(d)}{(e)}$ of this section is filed	1190
immediately shall forward a copy of the petition and a copy of	1191
the request if filed by the petitioner to the prosecuting	1192
attorney of the county served by the court. If the request for	1193
postconviction discovery is filed by the prosecuting attorney,	1194
the clerk of the court immediately shall forward a copy of the	1195
request to the petitioner or the petitioner's counsel.	1196
(C) If a person who has been sentenced to death and who	1197
files a petition for postconviction relief under division (A) $\underline{(1)}$	1198
(a)(i), (ii), (iii), or (iv) of this section requests a	1199
deposition or the prosecuting attorney in the case requests a	1200
deposition, and if the court grants the request under division	1201
(A) (1) $\frac{\text{(e)}}{\text{(e)}}$ of this section, the court shall notify the	1202
petitioner or the petitioner's counsel and the prosecuting	1203
attorney. The deposition shall be conducted pursuant to	1204
divisions (B), (D), and (E) of Criminal Rule 15. Notwithstanding	1205
division (C) of Criminal Rule 15, the petitioner is not entitled	1206
to attend the deposition. The prosecuting attorney shall be	1207
permitted to attend and participate in any deposition.	1208

(D) The court shall consider a petition that is timely

filed under within the period specified in division (A) (2) of

1209

1210

this section even if a direct appeal of the judgment is pending.	1211
Before granting a hearing on a petition filed under division (A)	1212
(1)(a)(i), (iii), (iii), or (iv) of this section, the court shall	1213
determine whether there are substantive grounds for relief. In	1214
making such a determination, the court shall consider, in	1215
addition to the petition, the supporting affidavits, and the	1216
documentary evidence, all the files and records pertaining to	1217
the proceedings against the petitioner, including, but not	1218
limited to, the indictment, the court's journal entries, the	1219
journalized records of the clerk of the court, and the court	1220
reporter's transcript. The court reporter's transcript, if	1221
ordered and certified by the court, shall be taxed as court	1222
costs. If the court dismisses the petition, it shall make and	1223
file findings of fact and conclusions of law with respect to	1224
such dismissal. If the petition was filed by a person who has	1225
been sentenced to death, the findings of fact and conclusions of	1226
law shall state specifically the reasons for the dismissal of	1227
the petition and of each claim it contains.	1228

- (E) Within ten days after the docketing of the petition, 1229 or within any further time that the court may fix for good cause 1230 shown, the prosecuting attorney shall respond by answer or 1231 motion. Division (A)(6) of this section applies with respect to 1232 the prosecuting attorney's response. Within twenty days from the 1233 date the issues are raised, either party may move for summary 1234 judgment. The right to summary judgment shall appear on the face 1235 of the record. 1236
- (F) Unless the petition and the files and records of the 1237 case show the petitioner is not entitled to relief, the court 1238 shall proceed to a prompt hearing on the issues even if a direct 1239 appeal of the case is pending. If the court notifies the parties 1240 that it has found grounds for granting relief, either party may 1241

request an appellate court in which a direct appeal of the	1242
judgment is pending to remand the pending case to the court.	1243
With respect to a petition filed under division (A)(1)(a)	1244
(iv) of this section, the procedures and rules regarding	1245
introduction of evidence and burden of proof at the pretrial	1246
hearing that are set forth in divisions (C), (D), and (F) of	1247
section 2929.025 of the Revised Code apply in considering the	1248
petition. With respect to such a petition, the grounds for	1249
granting relief are that the person has been diagnosed with one	1250
or more of the conditions set forth in division (A)(1)(a) of	1251
section 2929.025 of the Revised Code and that, at the time of	1252
the aggravated murder that was the basis of the sentence of	1253
death, the condition or conditions significantly impaired the	1254
person's capacity in a manner described in division (A)(1)(b) of	1255
that section.	1256
(G) A petitioner who files a petition under division (A)	1257
(1)(a)(i), (iii), (iii), or (iv) of this section may amend the	1258
petition as follows:	1259
(1) If the petition was filed by a person who has been	1260
sentenced to death, at any time that is not later than one	1261
hundred eighty days after the petition is filed, the petitioner	1262
may amend the petition with or without leave or prejudice to the	1263
proceedings.	1264
(2) If division (G)(1) of this section does not apply, at	1265
any time before the answer or motion is filed, the petitioner	1266
may amend the petition with or without leave or prejudice to the	1267
proceedings.	1268
(3) The petitioner may amend the petition with leave of	1269
court at any time after the expiration of the applicable period	1270

specified in division (G)(1) or (2) of this section.	1271
(H) If the court does not find grounds for granting	1272
relief, it shall make and file findings of fact and conclusions	1273
of law and shall enter judgment denying relief on the petition.	1274
If the petition was filed by a person who has been sentenced to	1275
death, the findings of fact and conclusions of law shall state	1276
specifically the reasons for the denial of relief on the	1277
petition and of each claim it contains. If no direct appeal of	1278
the case is pending and the court finds grounds for relief or if	1279
a pending direct appeal of the case has been remanded to the	1280
court pursuant to a request made pursuant to division (F) of	1281
this section and the court finds grounds for granting relief, it	1282
shall make and file findings of fact and conclusions of law and	1283
shall enter a judgment that vacates and sets aside the judgment	1284
in question, and, in the case of a petitioner who is a prisoner	1285
in custody, except as otherwise described in this division,	1286
shall discharge or resentence the petitioner or grant a new	1287
trial as the court determines appropriate. <u>If the court finds</u>	1288
grounds for relief in the case of a petitioner who filed a	1289
petition under division (A)(1)(a)(iv) of this section, the court	1290
shall render void the sentence of death and order the	1291
resentencing of the offender under division (A) of section	1292
2929.06 of the Revised Code. If the petitioner has been	1293
sentenced to death, the findings of fact and conclusions of law	1294
shall state specifically the reasons for the finding of grounds	1295
for granting the relief, with respect to each claim contained in	1296
the petition. The court also may make supplementary orders to	1297
the relief granted, concerning such matters as rearraignment,	1298
retrial, custody, and bail. If the trial court's order granting	1299
the petition is reversed on appeal and if the direct appeal of	1300
the case has been remanded from an appellate court pursuant to a	1301

request under division (F) of this section, the appellate court	1302
reversing the order granting the petition shall notify the	1303
appellate court in which the direct appeal of the case was	1304
pending at the time of the remand of the reversal and remand of	1305
the trial court's order. Upon the reversal and remand of the	1306
trial court's order granting the petition, regardless of whether	1307
notice is sent or received, the direct appeal of the case that	1308
was remanded is reinstated.	1309
(I) Upon the filing of a petition pursuant to division (A)	1310

- (I) Upon the filing of a petition pursuant to division (A)

 (1) (a) (i), (iii), or (iv) of this section by a person

 1311

 sentenced to death, only the supreme court may stay execution of

 the sentence of death.

 1313
- (J)(1) If a person sentenced to death intends to file a 1314 petition under this section, the court shall appoint counsel to 1315 represent the person upon a finding that the person is indigent 1316 and that the person either accepts the appointment of counsel or 1317 is unable to make a competent decision whether to accept or 1318 reject the appointment of counsel. The court may decline to 1319 appoint counsel for the person only upon a finding, after a 1320 hearing if necessary, that the person rejects the appointment of 1321 counsel and understands the legal consequences of that decision 1322 or upon a finding that the person is not indigent. 1323
- (2) The court shall not appoint as counsel under division 1324 (J) (1) of this section an attorney who represented the 1325 petitioner at trial in the case to which the petition relates 1326 unless the person and the attorney expressly request the 1327 appointment. The court shall appoint as counsel under division 1328 (J) (1) of this section only an attorney who is certified under 1329 Rule 20 of the Rules of Superintendence for the Courts of Ohio 1330 to represent indigent defendants charged with or convicted of an 1331

H. B. No. 136
As Introduced

offense for which the death penalty can be or has been imposed.	1332
The ineffectiveness or incompetence of counsel during	1333
proceedings under this section does not constitute grounds for	1334
relief in a proceeding under this section, in an appeal of any	1335
action under this section, or in an application to reopen a	1336
direct appeal.	1337
(3) Division (J) of this section does not preclude	1338
attorneys who represent the state of Ohio from invoking the	1339
provisions of 28 U.S.C. 154 with respect to capital cases that	1340
were pending in federal habeas corpus proceedings prior to July	1341
1, 1996, insofar as the petitioners in those cases were	1342
represented in proceedings under this section by one or more	1343
counsel appointed by the court under this section or section	1344
120.06, 120.16, 120.26, or 120.33 of the Revised Code and those	1345
appointed counsel meet the requirements of division (J)(2) of	1346
this section.	1347
(K) Subject to the appeal of a sentence for a felony that	1348
is authorized by section 2953.08 of the Revised Code, the remedy	1349
set forth in this section is the exclusive remedy by which a	1350
person may bring a collateral challenge to the validity of a	1351
conviction or sentence in a criminal case or to the validity of	1352
an adjudication of a child as a delinquent child for the	1353
commission of an act that would be a criminal offense if	1354
committed by an adult or the validity of a related order of	1355
disposition.	1356
Sec. 2953.23. (A) Whether a hearing is or is not held on a	1357
petition filed pursuant to section 2953.21 of the Revised Code,	1358
a court may not entertain a petition filed after the expiration	1359
of the period prescribed in division (A) of that section or a	1360
second notition or suggestive notitions for similar relief on	1361

behalf of a petitioner unless division (A)(1) or (2) of this 1362 section applies: 1363 (1) Both of the following apply: 1364 (a) Either the petitioner shows that the petitioner was 1365 unavoidably prevented from discovery of the facts upon which the 1366 petitioner must rely to present the claim for relief, or, 1367 subsequent to the period prescribed in division (A)(2) of 1368 section 2953.21 of the Revised Code or to the filing of an 1369 earlier petition, the United States Supreme Court recognized a 1370 new federal or state right that applies retroactively to persons 1371 in the petitioner's situation, and the petition asserts a claim 1372 based on that right. 1373 (b) The petitioner shows by clear and convincing evidence 1374 that, but for constitutional error at trial, no reasonable 1375 factfinder would have found the petitioner guilty of the offense 1376 of which the petitioner was convicted or, if the claim 1377 challenges a sentence of death that, but for constitutional 1378 error at the sentencing hearing, no reasonable factfinder would 1379 have found the petitioner eligible for the death sentence. 1380 1381 (2) The petitioner was convicted of a felony, the petitioner is an offender for whom DNA testing was performed 1382 under sections 2953.71 to 2953.81 of the Revised Code or under 1383 former section 2953.82 of the Revised Code and analyzed in the 1384 context of and upon consideration of all available admissible 1385 evidence related to the inmate's case as described in division 1386 (D) of section 2953.74 of the Revised Code, and the results of 1387 the DNA testing establish, by clear and convincing evidence, 1388 actual innocence of that felony offense or, if the person was 1389 sentenced to death, establish, by clear and convincing evidence, 1390 actual innocence of the aggravating circumstance or 1391

circumstances the person was found guilty of committing and that	1392
is or are the basis of that sentence of death.	1393
As used in this division, "actual innocence" has the same	1394
meaning as in division (A)(1) $\frac{(b)}{(c)}$ of section 2953.21 of the	1395
Revised Code, and "former section 2953.82 of the Revised Code"	1396
has the same meaning as in division (A)(1) $\frac{(c)}{(d)}$ of section	1397
2953.21 of the Revised Code.	1398
(B) An order awarding or denying relief sought in a	1399
petition filed pursuant to section 2953.21 of the Revised Code	1400
is a final judgment and may be appealed pursuant to Chapter	1401
2953. of the Revised Code.	1402
If a petition filed pursuant to section 2953.21 of the	1403
Revised Code by a person who has been sentenced to death is	1404
denied and the person appeals the judgment, notwithstanding any	1405
law or court rule to the contrary, there is no limit on the	1406
number of pages in, or on the length of, a notice of appeal or	1407
briefs related to an appeal filed by the person. If any court	1408
rule specifies a limit on the number of pages in, or on the	1409
length of, a notice of appeal or briefs described in this	1410
division or on a prosecuting attorney's response or briefs with	1411
respect to such an appeal and a person who has been sentenced to	1412
death files a notice of appeal or briefs that exceed the limit	1413
specified for the petition, the prosecuting attorney may file a	1414
response or briefs that exceed the limit specified for the	1415
answer or briefs.	1416
Section 2. That existing sections 2929.02, 2929.022,	1417
2929.024, 2929.03, 2929.04, 2929.06, 2953.21, and 2953.23 of the	1418
Revised Code are hereby repealed.	1419
Section 3. Notwithstanding section 1.50 of the Revised	1420

H. B. No. 136 As Introduced Code, if any provision of a section as amended or enacted by 1421 this act is determined to be unconstitutional or otherwise 1422 invalid in a final judgment by a court of last resort, the 1423 remainder of the enactments and amendments made in Section 1 of 1424 this act are void.